For this particular peer critique workshop, we will work on strengthening the analysis—in particular, the claims, evidence, and discussions. In your group, determine how you will divide the work and also discuss and agree upon what you expect from your peers. Remember, you will be graded for the quality of your response. Respond to the following prompts:

1. **Introduction**: Use one of the colors to highlight what you believe their **thesis** to be.

   Does the thesis statement present a strong argument/position?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Does the intro give a brief but clear idea of what the paper will prove?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

2. Using three different-colored highlighters, highlight 1) the claim (point) in one color, 2) the evidence (illustration) in another color, and 3) the discussion (explanation) in the third color for every body paragraph (ignoring the introduction and the conclusion). Then answer the following questions for each paragraph (repeat step 2 for every paragraph).

   **Paragraph 1**
   Is it a strong claim?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   How Strong is the claim? Circle: 5 (strong) → 1 (weak)  
   5 4 3 2 1  

   Does the claim focus on analyzing the text (vs. the situation)?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Is there ample evidence?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Does the evidence support the claim?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Is there ample discussion?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Does the discussion explain the claim and evidence?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Does the discussion section sufficiently analyze the text?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Does the research seem critical and credible?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   What suggestions do you have for the author? ___________________________________________________________
   _____________________________________________________________________________________________

   **Paragraph 2**
   Is it a strong claim?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   How Strong is the claim? Circle: 5 (strong) → 1 (weak)  
   5 4 3 2 1  

   Does the claim focus on analyzing the text (vs. the situation)?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Is there ample evidence?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Does the evidence support the claim?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Is there ample discussion?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Does the discussion explain the claim and evidence?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Does the discussion section sufficiently analyze the text?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   Does the research seem critical and credible?  
   Yes____ No____ Somewhat____

   What suggestions do you have for the author? ___________________________________________________________
   _____________________________________________________________________________________________
Paragraph 3
Is it a strong claim? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
How Strong is the claim? Circle: 5 (strong) → 1(weak) 5 • 4 • 3 • 2 • 1
Does the claim focus on analyzing the text (vs. the situation)? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Is there ample evidence? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Does the evidence support the claim? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Is there ample discussion? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Does the discussion explain the claim and evidence? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Does the discussion section sufficiently analyze the text? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Does the research seem critical and credible? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
What suggestions do you have for the author? ____________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________

Paragraph 4
Is it a strong claim? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
How Strong is the claim? Circle: 5 (strong) → 1(weak) 5 • 4 • 3 • 2 • 1
Does the claim focus on analyzing the text (vs. the situation)? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Is there ample evidence? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Does the evidence support the claim? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Is there ample discussion? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Does the discussion explain the claim and evidence? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Does the discussion section sufficiently analyze the text? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
Does the research seem critical and credible? Yes___ No___ Somewhat___
What suggestions do you have for the author? ____________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________

3. **Conclusion**: The conclusion should leave readers with a clear idea what the paper has proven. Does the conclusion give you a sense of what the paper has proven?

   Yes___ No___ Somewhat___

What suggestions do you have for the conclusion? ____________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________

4. Provide the writer with what they need to do next in order for this paper to be even stronger. Discuss the quality of their research (do they have strong credible academic and expert sources?). Remember to be extremely critical of their work as it will benefit them:

__________________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________________