The Portrayal of Older Adults in Indian and U.S. Magazine Advertisements

Jake Harwood
Department of Communication Studies,
University of Kansas, Lawrence, Kansas, USA

Abhik Roy
Department of Human Communication Studies
Howard University
Washington, DC, USA

This paper reports a content analysis of print advertisements from five popular magazines in the United States and five in India. Advertisements featuring older adults were examined to describe the nature of the portrayals. Older adults were shown to be presented in a relatively positive light in both cultures, that is, well groomed, active, healthy, and happy. However, older women were underrepresented in both cultures as compared with older men. Cultural differences were found in terms of the products with which older adult characters were associated, the types of magazines in which they were featured, and the physical and social settings in which they were shown. The results of the study are discussed in terms of theoretical and applied issues and suggestions for future research are provided.

KEYWORDS media portrayals, older adults, magazine advertisements, India, United States

Advertising is a ubiquitous cultural form that reflects and molds our lives. According to McLuhan (1964) “the ads of our time are the richest and the most faithful daily reflections that any society ever made of its entire range of activities” (p. 232). Similarly, Unwin (1974) calls advertisements “the folklore of the Twentieth Century.” Thus, we can gain insight into the mores of a culture by carefully examining advertising images. Given that the goal of advertising is to appeal to the viewer and make them desire a product, advertisers clearly have a goal of producing messages that appeal to the desires and values of the culture in which the product is to be sold. Given the brevity of most advertising messages (single magazine

The authors are grateful to Sherry Holladay for comments on an earlier version of this paper. The assistance of Amy Leyerzapf and Chris Rohr in coding the advertisements is also acknowledged. An earlier version of this article was presented at the annual meeting of the National Communication Association, Chicago, November 1997.

Address correspondence to Jake Harwood, Department of Communication Studies, 3090 Wescoe Hall, University of Kansas, Lawrence, KS 66045-2177, USA. E-mail: harwood@falcon.cc.ukans.edu

The Howard Journal of Communications, 10:269–280, 1999
Copyright © 1999 Taylor & Francis
1064-6175/99 $12.00 + .00
269
pages, 30 seconds of television time), we might also expect advertisers’ images to portray society’s desires and values in a relatively explicit fashion. Interesting work on the cultural mores displayed in advertisements has been carried out in Brazil (Tansey, Hyman, & Zinkhan, 1990), China (Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996), India (Srikandath, 1991), Japan (Belk & Pollay, 1985; Lin, 1993; Mueller, 1987), the Philippines (Marquez, 1975), and the United Kingdom (Frith & Sengupta, 1991, Frith & Wesson, 1991; Katz & Lee, 1992).

Given these arguments, we can expect to learn something about the place of particular subgroups in societies by examining the portrayal of those subgroups in advertisements (Bramlett-Solomon & Wilson, 1989). Subgroups that are valued will be portrayed frequently and in positive contexts. Subgroups that are not valued will not be featured as part of commercial appeal, or they will be featured in a negative or demeaning/humorous context. In addition to revealing the position of subgroups in a society, we might expect advertising images to have some effects on attitudes toward those groups, if only in reinforcing existing predispositions. While the current work is not aimed at uncovering such effects, they should be borne in mind. As noted by Pollay (1983), “advertising is...the only institution with a cadre of applied behavioral scientists working continually to enhance the effectiveness of its influence” (p. 73).

In our study, we examined how older adults are portrayed in print magazine advertisements in India and the United States. In the United States, older adults have received considerable attention from media researchers. A large number of studies have examined portrayals of older adults in television, movies, literature, and the like, as well as studied older adults’ uses of certain media (see Robinson & Skill, 1995, for a review). Most specifically related to the current research, studies have looked at portrayals of older adults in U.S. print advertisements (Baker & Goggin, 1994; Bramlett-Solomon & Wilson, 1989; Gantz, Gartenberg, & Rainbow, 1980; Peterson, 1992; Ursic, Ursic, & Ursic, 1986). This research has largely demonstrated the underrepresentation and negative portrayal of older adults, although not all research on advertising has shown this pattern. However, at present we know very little about cross-cultural variation in portrayals of older adults in popular media. The importance of such cross-cultural investigations has been underscored by Kubey (1980; see also Hill, Long, & Cupach, 1997). Outside of the media sphere, the need for cross-cultural research on age groups in society has been emphasized by researchers in social gerontology and research has begun to address these issues (e.g., Harwood et al., 1996; Levy & Langer, 1994; Williams et al., 1997).

We sought to address this need for cross-cultural examinations by looking at older adults’ place in magazine advertisements in the United States and India. Our goal was to understand more about the roles associated with older adults and the value placed on aging in these two cultures. India and the United States were selected because of some interesting contrasts between the two cultures in terms of issues relevant to aging. Indian culture tends to be more collectivist, has stronger extended family systems, and traditionally has venerated the wisdom of elderly people (Mehra, 1989; Subrahmanium, 1988; Thomas, 1988). In contrast, North American culture is more individualistic, adopts a more nuclear family structure, and has a youth orientation that is often associated with negative attitudes toward older adults (Bellah, 1987; Hofstede, 1984; Kite & Johnson, 1988). While older adults in the United
Portrayal of Older Adults

States often enjoy an affluent, independent status, their Indian counterparts are almost always dependent on their children for financial and emotional support. Our investigation allowed us to determine how older American adults (who often enjoy a high discretionary income) are depicted in U.S. magazine advertisements as compared with older Indian adults (who have considerably less discretionary income, but who have a more pivotal role in the Indian family system).

In this study, we aimed to answer a number of research questions. First, previous research has frequently bemoaned the relative underrepresentation of older women in various North American media (Dail, 1988; Gerbner, Gross, Signorielli, & Morgan, 1980; Robinson & Skill, 1995). The current research explores whether such underrepresentation extends across cultures.

RQ1: Do Indian and U.S. magazine advertisements feature older men more than older women?

Second, we hoped to go beyond analyses of simple demographic features to examine the nature of portrayals of older adults. Hence, we examined a number of variables associated with the way in which older adults in these advertisements were portrayed.

RQ2: Are there differences in the depiction of older adults in Indian and U.S. magazine advertisements?

Third, we examined the products that featured older adults in their advertisements. The items with which older adults are associated seemed likely to provide some insights into the values associated with older people and the markets being targeted for particular products.

RQ3: When older adults are featured, with what products are they associated in the U.S. and India?

Finally, and in a similar vein, we examined the presence of older adults across different types of magazines (e.g., business, news, sports). Again, the presence of older people in magazines with particular foci seemed to be a good guide to the values and characteristics associated with this group of people.

RQ4: Are there differences in terms of the number of older adults present across different magazines types in the United States and India?

Method

Five popular magazine genres were identified, and exemplar magazines from each category were selected from India and the United States. Specifically, we examined women’s magazines, sports magazines, entertainment magazines, news magazines, and business magazines (Indian magazines: Femina, Sportstar, Society, India Today, and Business India; U.S. magazines: Cosmopolitan, Sports Illustrated, People, Newsweek, and Business Week). In all cases, attempts were made to examine equivalent publications from the two countries. Where possible we selected the clear market
leader in a particular category. Where there was not a clear market leader, the authors examined magazines and consulted frequent readers of the magazines to achieve the greatest similarity possible. For instance, in the women's magazine category, two regular readers of U.S. women's magazines were shown copies of *Femina* and agreed that it was more similar to *Cosmopolitan* than other major U.S. women's publications.

To ensure a random sample, a single month was randomly selected from 1996. That month and alternate months surrounding that month in the calendar year were selected, resulting in a total of six months. This procedure approximates a systematic probability sample with a random start (see Singleton, Straits, Straits, & McAllister, 1988, p. 151). Finally, within each month a date was randomly selected, resulting in six target dates (February 22, April 28, June 10, August 2, October 7, and December 2). For each magazine, the issue published closest to each target date in 1996 was selected for analysis, resulting in six copies each of the five Indian magazines and the five U.S. magazines. This procedure seemed preferable to a simple random sample of each magazine, because it controls for potential seasonal variation in the content of magazines while ensuring a diversity of issues from across the year.

All advertisements larger than a quarter page and featuring people were selected for further analysis. Advertisements not featuring human models were discarded. A sample of 80 of these advertisements featuring people was coded for the presence of older adults by two coders. Coders were instructed to pay particular attention to direct mention of age (60 or above), extensive gray hair, extensive wrinkling of the face or hands or both, use of ambulatory aids (e.g., cane, crutches, wheelchairs, etc.), and any reference to being retired or being an older adult or both. Characters meeting a majority of these criteria were coded as older adults. Agreement on the presence of older adults was 85% (Krippendorf’s (1980) alpha = .66). Following this, the procedure was applied to the entire sample and all advertisements featuring older adults were retained for further analysis. The older adult character was treated as the unit of analysis for subsequent coding: for advertisements featuring multiple older characters, each character was coded separately. A total of 173 older adult characters were identified.

Each older adult character was rated on a number of variables by two coders (see Table 1 for reliability estimates). The character’s sex was coded. In addition, coders used a 12-category scheme to record the nature of the product being advertised. Categories were personal hygiene (e.g., shampoo), automobiles, travel (e.g., airlines), cigarettes/tobacco, clothing, food, phones/communication services, housekeeping (e.g., cleaning products), interior decoration, children’s items, media products (e.g., movies), and other miscellaneous products. The size of the role portrayed by each character was coded using a three-category scheme. The character was identified as being either the “lead” character in the ad, one of a number of major characters, or a minor character.

The social/relational context in which the character was presented was also coded. This variable was concerned with the way in which the older adult was portrayed in relation to other people in the advertisement. A ten-category scheme included options such as coworker, providing service, spouse/romantic partner, and the like. The physical context in which the character was portrayed was also coded. The eight categories included options such as outdoors in a natural setting, in a car,
Table 1  Reliability Estimates and Summary of Cultural Differences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nature of Statistically Significant Cultural Differences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alpha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size of role</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social/relational context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grooming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facial expression</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Intercoder agreement on these variables was over 85%; however, due to unbalanced distributions the alpha is lower than might be preferred. The variables were retained due to their pragmatic interest and the relatively high percentage agreement.

in a home, in a workplace, and the like. Finally, each older adult character was rated on four ordinal scales designed to evaluate important dimensions associated with stereotypes of older adults (Hummert, 1994). These scales assessed the older characters’ level of grooming, their facial expression, their health, and their apparent activity level. These were coded on three category ordinal scales (e.g., poorly groomed, average, well groomed). For all of the variables, written definitions were developed with the assistance of coders through extensive practice sessions with advertisements not from the current data set. Reliability was assessed prior to coding of the advertisements in our sample (see Table 1).

Results

Of the 173 older adult characters identified in the sample, 75 were from Indian magazines, while 98 were from U.S. advertisements. There was no significant difference in the ratio of older men to older women across the two cultures (see RQ1). In both cultures women were substantially underrepresented in the advertisements (29% of older characters were women—50 out of 173). In the U.S. advertisements, 32% of the older characters were women, while in the Indian advertisements women constituted 25% of the older characters.
To address RQ2, cross-cultural comparisons on the variables concerning portrayals were performed. In order not to violate statistical assumptions of the chi-square test, categories that occurred very infrequently across both cultures were excluded from the statistical analysis. They are commented on separately when the low frequencies are suggestive of a trend.

Differences emerged in terms of the physical context in which the characters were portrayed ($X^2(3) = 16.35, p < .01$). Advertisements from the United States featured older adults in outdoor settings and in settings without any scenery or props (generally a face/body shot against a blank background) more than advertisements from India. In contrast, elderly Indians were shown more frequently than their U.S. counterparts in work situations. Interestingly, four older characters were portrayed in institutional settings in the U.S. advertisements (e.g., in a nursing home), while no older adults were portrayed as institutionalized in the Indian advertisements. While these numbers are too small to be subject to statistical analysis, they may suggest an interesting trend.

Differences also emerged in codings of social/relation context ($X^2(4) = 22.36, p < .001$). Older people in the United States were shown more often with their spouses, their work colleagues, or in a situation in which they were providing or receiving a service. Indian advertisements featured older adults with other unknown individuals more than U.S. advertisements. The most common portrayal in Indian advertisements was of older adults alone, although this was not significantly different from the United States where such portrayals were also common.

No differences emerged in terms of the size of role given to older people across cultures ($X^2(2) = 0.80, p > .60$). In general, older adults were accorded major roles in the ads in which they appeared (98% of the time they were either a major character or the lead character in the advertisements we examined). Of course, this may be the case with portrayals of all age groups: minor or peripheral characters may be rare in magazine advertisements.

Two sets of analyses were performed on the ratings of facial expression, activity, health, and grooming. First, one-sample t-tests were performed comparing the overall evaluations of older adult characters with the midpoint of the scale. For three of four scales evaluations were significantly more positive than the midpoint of the scale, while the remaining scale mean was not significantly different from the midpoint. (Midpoint of scale = 2; lower scores indicate more positive evaluations: health: $M = 2.01$, t(172) = .45, $p > .05$; activity: $M = 1.96$, t(172) = −2.13, $p < .05$; facial expression: $M = 1.57$, t(172) = −9.78, $p < .001$; health: $M = 1.66$, t(172) = −7.98, $p < .001$.) These evaluations indicate a broadly positive portrayal of the older adult character across cultures in terms of dimensions particularly important to stereotyping of older people. Second, independent subjects’ t-tests were performed to examine cultural differences in these evaluations. There were no differences in the level of grooming, health, or activity level across the two cultures (all t’s < 1.5, all p’s > .10). However, facial expressions in the U.S. advertisements were significantly more positive ($M = 1.47$) than in the Indian advertisements ($M = 1.69$, t(171) = 2.54, $p < .05$).³

Significant differences emerged in the types of products that were advertised using older adult models ($X^2(5) = 19.30, p < .01$). Specifically, older adults were featured in advertisements for clothing and media products (magazines, movies, etc.)
in India more than in the United States. Conversely, older adults were represented more often in U.S. advertisements for food, cars, and travel than in Indian advertisements (see RQ3).

Finally, in response to RQ4, we found significant differences in terms of the number of older adults present across the magazine genres ($\chi^2(4) = 20.04, p < .001$). The sports magazines featured more older adults in the United States ($N = 12$) as opposed to India ($N = 1$), whereas the women’s magazines featured more older adults in India ($N = 16$) than in the United States ($N = 3$). There were no significant differences in the other magazine types (i.e., entertainment, news, and business magazines). Key cultural differences on coded variables are summarized in Table 1.

**Discussion**

In line with previous work in North America, this research found a cross-cultural bias against older women in their mass media presence. The predominance of elderly men over elderly women in the advertisements reflects the “double jeopardy” of being old and female (Sontag, 1979). Whereas older males are sometimes evaluated as wise and mature, older females rarely receive any form of positive evaluation, even though they outnumber elderly males in the U.S. population (United States Bureau of the Census, 1994). It should be noted that women do not outnumber men among older adults in India (Bose, 1988). The low visibility of older women in our study provides evidence that this unfortunate collaboration of ageism and sexism in the media persists across cultures. An informal examination of the advertisements also revealed this phenomenon in the portrayals of older women and men that were present. Indian advertisements tended to depict older males in the public domain of work. They were often portrayed making decisions, for instance in a high-technology laboratory. Older women, when present, were typically shown in the domestic domain, busy with chores such as cooking. The pattern in the United States was similar, with men being shown as leaders or professionals and women being shown in social settings, either alone or relaxing with family. In both cultures, advertisements seemed to make a distinction between the public and the private sphere, sending an underlying ideological message that the public domain of work was the “natural” place for males.

This study also finds that older adults are generally positively portrayed in magazine advertisements both in India and the United States. In both cultures they were depicted as well-groomed, active, and healthy, with no cultural differences on these dimensions. However, older adults in the United States were shown with more positive facial expressions than Indians across the advertisements. This finding might be attributed to cultural differences in attitudes toward older adults. Older adults in India are often venerated for their spiritual and mental maturity, which might account for them being portrayed as serene and happy without necessarily smiling or laughing (Thomas, 1988). That said, some scholars have suggested that the history of religious thought in India lays out a more ambivalent orientation towards older adults (see Tilak, 1989). Differences in facial expressions may also reflect a more general cultural difference in advertising practices (i.e., American advertisers preferring ultrapositive portrayals in general).
It is interesting that there were more older adults present in Indian women’s magazines as compared with the U.S. women’s magazines. A possible explanation is that Indian society still prescribes a more traditional role for women than the United States. As a result, *Femina* (the Indian women’s magazine) featured advertisements for cooking equipment and the like, which would be rare in an American publication such as *Cosmopolitan*. These Indian advertisements were more suited to older adult models/spokespeople than the advertisements for clothing and cosmetics that dominated *Cosmopolitan*. In the United States, on the other hand, sports magazines appeared to have a place for older adult models that was not present in India. Themes of endurance and lifelong participation in physical exercise are popular among sports goods advertisers in the United States, and these themes appear to be reflected in our data. The extent to which such advertisements are positive (in portraying physical strength and endurance in late life) or negative (in terms of reinforcing notions that older athletes are unusual or atypical) is not an issue that can be addressed by the current analysis, but it is an important one for future work to address.

Finally, the results suggest a trend whereby older adults are occasionally portrayed in institutional settings in the United States, but not in India. Culturally speaking, this may be a simple reflection of the higher frequency of institutionalization in the United States (approximately 4% to 5%: United States Bureau of the Census, 1994) compared with India (approximately 0.7%: Dandekar, 1996). Such portrayals are interesting in the context of a broadly positive depiction across the other advertisements. Clearly the strategic use of such images may serve important emotive functions for advertisers, and from a gerontological perspective such images may be important in retaining a diverse picture of older adulthood in advertisements. However, we would not want to see a growth in such portrayals, given their potential for reinforcing stereotypes of older adults as frail and dependent.

Naturally, there are limitations with the current study. First, as with most content analytic studies, the coding system is limited to a relatively small number of dimensions. It is essential to seek a balance between obtaining a relatively complex picture of the target stimuli and seeking parsimony in descriptions of results. In the future, it will be important to understand which dimensions of portrayals are particularly powerful in influencing everyday readers of magazines. This may lead us toward a set of dimensions that can most efficiently and usefully describe a particular data set. That said, the current analysis is part of a growing trend of research that considers the quality of portrayals rather than simply providing descriptions of the quantity of older adults present in a particular corpus. Hence, we see clear signs of development in terms of the sophistication of content analytic techniques.

The reliability of the coding categories is also always a concern for content analyses. The majority of the variables in this study achieved a high degree of reliability (see Table 1), with a few exceptions. These low reliability estimates are largely attributable to categories where there was little variation in the practice stimulus materials. For instance, in a data set featuring mostly positive facial expressions, a single disagreement can lower reliability more than it would in a more diverse set of images. In the future, materials used for practice coding should be examined to ensure sufficient diversity to obtain meaningful reliability estimates.

Finally, in an investigation such as the current one, certain issues of control are
relevant. In particular, when comparing across cultures it is impossible to obtain stimuli that are absolutely equivalent. We feel confident that the magazines we selected serve similar functions in the two cultures. However, as outlined above, the products advertised in the women’s magazines, for instance, were not identical across cultures.\textsuperscript{4} Hence, the differences that we observed may at times be a result of “indirect” cultural effects. If one culture advertises a particular type of product more than another and that product lends itself to advertisements featuring older people, then that culture may end up featuring more older people in advertisements. Such an effect would be attributable to one culture’s emphasis on particular product categories, rather than a differential focus on older adults. It is clearly impossible to track all such indirect effects, but it is important to note them when they appear significant. Complete control, of course, would not always be desirable. In the present study our goal was to provide an overview of the position of older adults in advertising in the two cultures. Whether such differences are a product of direct or indirect cultural factors does not detract from this goal.

There are some practical implications of these results, although the study is primarily descriptive. In particular, the study may have identified some culturally specific lacunae in the portrayal of older adults. These lacunae could be profitably exploited by enterprising advertisers. For example, advertisements for telephone equipment and services in the United States rarely featured older adults. It might be relatively easy to capture a portion of the older adult market by featuring older models in campaigns for such products and services. Complementary points could be made about food products in the Indian market (Anderson, 1990; Balazs, 1995).

The research is also useful in demonstrating the limitations to naive theories of culture. A simplistic prediction at the outset of the research might have been that India, as an Asian culture, will have more frequent and positive portrayals of older adults. What actually emerges in the research is a considerably more complex pattern of specific cultural differences, leading to problems in making any gross cultural generalizations. This is probably a far more accurate representation of the nature of cultural differences, particularly in a global medium such as magazine advertisements. The finding that Asian cultures are perhaps not as deferential to older adults as Western stereotypes suggest has also emerged in other spheres of research (Harwood et al., 1996; Williams et al., 1997).

Significant future research is possible given the basis of the current study. First, there is clearly scope for much broader cross-cultural comparisons. The U.S.–India comparison was of interest given the size of the two countries, the shared language of their mainstream media, and their differences on important cultural dimensions (e.g., individualism–collectivism). However, attempts to examine across European and African contexts as well as American and Asian might reveal additional interesting findings, some of which might serve to contextualize the current findings better.

Second, content analytic work should not be performed to the exclusion of other examinations of media messages. Fine-grained qualitative examinations of particular advertisements would be a valuable complement to this research. For instance, across different cultures it might be possible to find advertisements featuring older adults promoting similar products in similar magazines. At that point, detailed examination of the texts and images of the advertisements might reveal fascinating insights into the ways in which older adult characters are used to appeal to consumers in those
particular contexts. The cultural meanings associated with aging that emerged from such comparisons would be valuable in better understanding evaluations of aging on a global level.

This research might also be complemented by more ethnographic research among practicing advertisers. It would be exciting to examine the decision-making process surrounding the inclusion of an older adult character in a particular campaign, and the values that advertisers believe such a character provides to their product. If combined with work on consumers’ interpretations of particular advertisements, such research might help us understand the role of cognitions concerning age in the entire advertising process.

The most significant contribution of this study is its cross-cultural focus. Instead of examining the depiction of older adults within North America (which has dominated the content analytic literature), this study examines representations across cultures and uncovers unpredictable commonalities and differences. Further work in this area could begin to provide an alternate means to understanding attitudes and values associated with aging across cultures (Ikels et al., 1992; Williams et al., 1997). For social gerontologists, this will be useful in their attempts to understand older adults’ place in society. For media scholars, such research will provide new places to test theories concerning the effects of such portrayals and to test the generalizability of claims made about media content in North America. For practitioners, such examinations may provide interesting new ideas for how to include a currently disenfranchised group in their portrayals. If these new ideas featured more portrayals of older adults in more diverse roles, rewards might be achieved on dual levels. Advertisers would reap the rewards of appealing to a growing market of consumers, while simultaneously challenging current stereotypes of what it means all over the world to grow old.

Notes

1 In all cases, Indian magazines were English language publications. Magazines in Hindi and other vernacular languages are common in India; however, their appeal and readership are restricted by regions where those languages are spoken. English is an official language in India. Therefore, magazines published in English have high circulation and constitute good parallels to the large-market U.S. publications included in this research.

2 This is less than ideal reliability. Clearly making a dichotomous distinction (old/not old) regarding a continuous category (chronological age) will result in some error. Examination of the advertisements and discussions with coders make us confident that our ultimate sample is a good representation of advertisements featuring older adults. Coders were encouraged to classify “borderline” cases as older adults.

3 It should be noted that this was a scale on which measurement was not particularly reliable; hence these results should be treated with some caution. However, unreliable measures are more likely to impede finding statistical significance than they are to result in spurious findings.

4 This difference may be a function of slightly different audiences for the two magazines. One reader of our paper has suggested that Femina may be directed at slightly older and more mature women than Cosmopolitan. The difficulties in obtaining absolutely equivalent publications across the two cultures is again revealed.

References


