

Economics 696F, Causal Inference and Program Evaluation

Problem Set 3: due Friday, March 30

1. This question is based on Graddy, “Testing for Imperfect Competition in the Fulton Fish Market,” *RAND Journal of Economics*, 1995. Graddy collected data on a market for whiting (a kind of fish) at the Fulton fish market in New York City.

There are 111 daily observations on p (log price of fish), q (log quantity of fish). A measure of *offshore* weather is recorded in the variable *stormy* (indicates wave height greater than 4.5 feet and wind speed greater than 1.8 knots). There are also variables characterizing on-shore weather: *cold* (indicates temperature less than the median average daily temperature of 41.5 degrees), and *rainy* (indicates any precipitation during the day). In addition, there are dummy variables to indicate the day of the week: *mon*, *tue*, *wed*, and *thu*. These are contained in the Matlab file `hw3a.mat` and also in the ascii file `hw3a.dat`.

Consider the following supply and demand model

$$\text{Demand: } q = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 p + \epsilon^d,$$

$$\text{Supply: } q = \beta_0 + \beta_1 p + \beta_2 z + \epsilon^s.$$

Here $z = \text{stormy}$. The interpretation is that bad offshore weather shifts supply but not demand. Assume that ϵ^d and ϵ^s satisfy:

$$E[\epsilon^d|z] = 0, \quad E[\epsilon^s|z] = 0, \quad \text{Cov}[\epsilon^d, \epsilon^s|z] = 0.$$

- (a) Estimate the least-squares regression of q on a constant and p . We expect that the slope coefficient is a biased estimate of the demand elasticity. Determine whether the bias is positive or negative analytically.
- (b) Provide a consistent estimate of the demand elasticity using the data. Interpret the estimated elasticity.
- (c) It could be argued that the *stormy* variable cannot be excluded from the demand equation, since off-shore weather could affect demand, if only because it is correlated with on-shore weather. One solution is to use the other conditioning variables. Letting x denote the vector containing the variables *cold*, *rainy*, *mon*, *tue*, *wed*, and *thu*, consider the expanded model

$$\text{Demand: } q = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 p + \alpha'_2 x + \epsilon^d,$$

$$\text{Supply: } q = \beta_0 + \beta_1 p + \beta'_2 x + \beta_3 z + \epsilon^s.$$

Is the exclusion restriction more plausible in the expanded model?

- (d) Based on the expanded model of part (c), calculate the 2SLS estimate of the demand elasticity, along with the asymptotic standard error (under homoskedasticity).
- (e) Obtain standard errors that are robust to heteroskedasticity, and explain how these are calculated. Do these standard errors differ from the ones obtained in part (d)?
2. The file `hw3b.dat` contains observations on three variables, Y, X, Z assumed to follow the model in Imbens and Newey (2004).

Write a program to implement the Imbens-Newey estimator. In doing this, you can use a quadratic polynomial in Z when estimating $F_{X|Z}$. In other words, set $q^L(z) = (1, z, z^2)'$.

Also, use $p^K(w) = p^K(x, \eta) = (1, x, \eta, x \cdot \eta)'$.

For calculating the integral

$$\hat{\mu}(x) = \int_0^1 \hat{\beta}(x, \eta) d\eta,$$

you can approximate this by simply averaging $\hat{\beta}(x, \eta)$ over the grid

$$\eta \in \{.01, .02, \dots, .99\}.$$

Provide estimates of $\hat{\mu}(x)$ at $x = 0, .5, 1$.

You do not need to provide standard errors.