

(B)orderlands' Rhetorics and Representations: The Transformative Potential of Feminist Third-Space Scholarship and Zines

ADELA C. LICONA

This article identifies feminist third-space (both/and) consciousness in academic and nonacademic contexts. Although dissimilar, both academic discourses and zines (self-published magazines) are comprised of complex rhetorical performances with implications for feminist practices of representation and the re-production of meaning. This article first identifies academic third-space sites resulting from the crossing of disciplinary borders followed by an analysis of activist zines as examples of nonacademic third space, with particular emphasis on representations of bodies and sexualities. Zines reveal the (1) transformative potentials beyond gender binaries; (2) re-visioning of histories; (3) practices of reverso (critical reversals of the normative gaze); (4) deployment of (e)motion as embodied resistance; and (5) emergence of a coalitional consciousness and practices of articulation that have the potential to create and mobilize communities for social justice based on egalitarian social relationships.

Keywords: (b)orderlands' rhetorics / coalitional consciousness / decolonial imaginary / politics of articulation / third space / reverso / zines

The work of mestiza consciousness is to break down the subject-object duality that keeps her a prisoner and to show in the flesh and through the images in her work how duality is transcended.

—Gloria Anzaldúa, *Borderlands/La Frontera: The New Mestiza* (1987, 102)

In the quotation above, Gloria Anzaldúa references a mestiza consciousness as that which refuses fixed dichotomous structures and their implications for matters of (self) representation. Theories of mestizaje provide insight into the complexities of those of us whose borderlands' identities and lived experiences render visible the reductions of binary (mis)representations. Having grown up on the Mexico/U.S. border, my own understanding of the concept of borderlands is embodied, intuitive, psychic, and learned. It is also steeped in my geographic origins. In this paper, I move beyond geographic borderlands, while still retaining the notion of both/and consciousness that Anzaldúa theorizes. I begin with her definition of a borderland as a "vague and undetermined place created by the emotional residue of an unnatural boundary . . . in a constant state of transition" (25), and then move into the broader arena I identify as

"third space." I make this move to pursue and make meaning in coalition with others whose geographic location is not the border; that is, as an act of coalitional consciousness.

I have borrowed the term "third space" from Chela Sandoval (2000) who discusses U.S. third-world feminism as "third-space" feminism identified in the writings of a number of feminists of color and initiated in coalition as a critique of an identified white, hegemonic feminist movement. Third space can be understood as a location and/or practice. As a practice it reveals a differential consciousness¹ capable of engaging creative and coalitional forms of opposition to the limits of dichotomous (mis)representations. As a location, third space has the potential to be a space of shared understanding and meaning-making. Through a third-space consciousness then dualities are transcended to reveal fertile and reproductive spaces where subjects put perspectives, lived experiences, and rhetorical performances into play. In third-space sites, representational rhetorics emerge that I term, (b)orderlands' rhetorics. Unlike dualistic language structures, (b)orderlands' rhetorics move beyond binary borders to a named third space of ambiguity and even contradiction. The third-space consciousness inherent in (b)orderlands' rhetoric can be found, as I shall illustrate, in both academic and nonacademic discourses.

To represent third-space complexities inherent in (b)orderlands' rhetorics, I place parentheses around the b of (b)orderlands both to materialize a discursive border and to visibly underscore the myriad ways borders (much like dichotomies) have historically operated to artificially divide, order, and subordinate. However, the parentheses also work to interrupt any fixed reading of the notion of (b)orderlands. This neologic representation allows me to re-imagine and re-claim the generative potential of (b)orderlands' rhetorics that resist the delimitations of imposed (discursive) borders and acknowledge the inherent and generative relationships between ambiguous, oppositional, and even contradictory parts. (B)orderlands, then, imply both the structured and structuring places and practices that (b)order (order, outline, define, delimit, and discipline) our understandings of, and relationships to, one another. Writing (b)orderlands with the visible interruption of the parentheses is a way of representing a conscious transcendence to a generative third space of movement and messiness. In re-visioning third-space sites, subjectivities, and rhetorics and their transformative potentials as *sitios*, *lenguas*² y *tecnologías de resistencia*, y *transformación* I am both acknowledging and re-imagining the (historic) function of borders and re-visioning the notion of (b)orderlands.³

As a (b)orderlands' being I am neither wholly of one side or the other. I am not either/or but instead both/and. For third-space subjects, too, either/or is a fictional state of being, and of knowing, that demonstrates an

uneasiness with ambiguity and contradiction. Third-space lived experiences of both/and dilute notions of purity and authenticity so that neither are meaningful signifiers in third-space (con)texts. Third-space subjects (perpetually) slip and slide across both sides of a border to a third space, between the authentic and the inauthentic, the legitimate and the illegitimate, the pure and the impure, and the proper and the improper. The point of the theoretical undertakings in third-space sites is to uncover Other ways of being, and of knowing, in order to make meaning of the everyday. Third-space feminists have long contended that theory reflects, informs, and is informed by lived experiences.⁴

In third-space contexts, traditional reading, writing, and representational structures and practices are ruptured. (B)orderlands' rhetorics are subversive, third-space tactics that can prove discursively disobedient to the confines of phallogocentrism and its colonizing effects over time and place.⁵ Third-space subjects put language into play by using disruptive discursive strategies that reflect our lived experiences as fragmented, partial, real, and imagined, and always in the process of becoming. Before examining the implications of a (b)orderlands' rhetoric as it is practiced and performed in zines (self-published magazines), however, I first illustrate this rhetoric in academic sites likely to be more familiar to readers of this *Journal*. I then provide a brief account of historical and contemporary zines, followed by an analysis of the creative representational and activist potentials of feminist zines, with particular emphasis on representations of bodies and sexualities.

(B)orderlands' Practices in the Academy: Crossing Disciplinary Borders

The crossing of borders of differing knowledge systems represents manifest resistance to the academic apartheid that Sandoval describes as reductive, divisive, and exclusionary (2000). These interdisciplinary border crossings are third-space practices that offer a revitalized approach to the transformative potential of academics and activism. While not all together a new phenomena, crossing disciplinary boundaries is an increasingly visible practice being undertaken across a range of academic disciplines. Evidence of these academic peregrinations can be found in myriad academic journals and texts. As I shall illustrate, these cross-disciplinary, third-space practices have the potential to generate new perspectives and new knowledges that are represented by (b)orderlands' rhetorics. As illustrated, for example, in the work of Anne Fausto-Sterling, Susan Bordo, Donna Haraway, Emma Pérez, and Juana María Rodríguez, academic border crossings can be generative acts of resistance to imposed disciplinary orderings—be they scientific, social, sexual, historic, and/or cultural.⁶

Third spaces are being recognized and explored from feminist and biological perspectives in the work of Anne Fausto-Sterling. Specifically, Fausto-Sterling reveals the spaces beyond gender binaries by re-conceptualizing and naming the middle spaces of the biological construction of sexuality. Third space for Fausto-Sterling is about variation beyond what she considers to be the false and limiting dichotomy of the female/male construct. Her deployment of the notion of intersexuality materializes a (b)orderlands' rhetoric of representation. Her work challenges medical practitioners' blind allegiance to a dichotomized notion of male and female. In her border-crossing scholarship, Fausto-Sterling re-envisioning a "new ethic of medical treatment, one that permits ambiguity to thrive, rooted in a culture that has moved beyond gender hierarchies" (2000, 101). Her work promotes the "thriving" of ambiguity, especially in regard to sexual subjectivity, and in so doing it illustrates, from a medical/ethical perspective, the generative potential of third space.

Much in the way that Fausto-Sterling's discussion of intersexuality reveals how the biomedical profession has, historically, occluded feelings, expressions, and experiences of sexual ambiguity (2000, 64). Susan Bordo's work reverses the gaze on Western culture to reveal how it has so thoroughly dichotomized mind and body to effectively occlude their interconnectedness. Bordo identifies and investigates embodied resistances to the disciplining and subordinating practices and power of cultural images over time. Specifically, her work resists and re-visions the ways in which dualities are culturally re-inscribed and re-enforced in dominant contexts. She invokes a feminist politics of the body by calling for new ways of representing the body and embodied knowledge beyond binaries noting that "the study of the disordered body is as much the proper province of cultural critics in every field and of nonspecialists, ordinary but critically questioning citizens, as it is of the 'experts'" (1993, 69). Her work articulates history, practice, culture, and the material location of the body.

From yet another cross-disciplinary perspective, Donna Haraway employs the notion of transgenics to challenge and transcend the restrictions inherent in taxonomic dualisms in the study of genetics and evolution (1997). As many readers already know, to navigate the contested, third-space terrain of techno-science, Haraway has theorized a mythical late twentieth-century character—the hybridized cyborg (1991). Haraway's cyborg, a hybrid of machine and organism, challenges notions of purity, thereby resisting totalizing (coding) practices in a techno-scientific context. Specifically, her cyborg represents a third-space practice of recoding that blurs the boundaries between the technical and the organic. Haraway deploys a (b)orderlands' rhetoric to theorize and describe a hybrid subject that defies dichotomy. Haraway also theorizes the politics of articulation that work to link diverse sites and subjectivities in pursuit of coalitions, new knowledges, and representations (1992). She states that

"[c]ommitment and engagement, not their invalidation, in an emerging collective are the conditions of joining knowledge-producing and world-building practices" (315). The emerging collectives are predicated on a coalitional consciousness, itself made up of oppositional and differential practices, relations, and understandings, that allow for, and pursue "the pleasure[s] of regeneration in . . . chiasmatic borderlands" (306).

In another third-space project, Emma Pérez's *The Decolonial Imaginary: Writing Chicanas into History* (1999) explores the transformative potential of re-presenting the histories of those of us previously obscured from historical sight and significance. Citing Homi Bhabha, Pérez reconsiders that which has been "unspoken and unseen" as representative of interstitial spaces in an historic (b)orderlands' context (1999, 5). For Pérez⁷ the interstitial is an exterior, in between space that reflects the tensions and re-produced silences of multiple conjunctures within the context of the (b)orderlands. It is a space that "eludes invasion, a world unseen that cannot, will not, be colonized" (115). According to Pérez, it is the space of the decolonial imaginary, a third space of newness, re-articulated desire, re-visioned histories, and empowerment; in short, a space of the emancipation of third-space consciousness.

One final example of academic border crossing is Juana María Rodríguez's (2003) transformational concepts of identity. Her investigations of diverse (discursive) spaces and subjectivities reveal a plethora of fluid identity practices, and their material effects and consequences (2003). About her own work on activist pamphlets, legal testimonies, and cyberspace transcripts, Rodríguez writes, "It is precisely their unsanctioned status as objects of inquiry that opens up interpretive possibilities for . . . representation[s] . . . as they announce the contradictory contours of the discursive spaces in which they emerge" (8). The "contradictory contours" that she references are, for me, third spaces from which emerge a (b)orderlands' rhetoric. Rodríguez invites readers to suspend "preconceived notions of academic disciplinarity, research, language, and scholarship to re-imagine the practice of knowledge production" (3). Such invitations are important to third-space projects.

Third-space academic peregrinations work beyond oppositional dualisms to reveal new discursive tactics and rhetorical performances. These academic examples of third-space projects reveal creative terrain from which a (b)orderlands' rhetoric is being deployed to reveal activist pursuits of alternative perspectives and new knowledges. As I demonstrate next, third-space sites beyond the academy, such as zines, also are generating (b)orderlands' rhetorics of representation. Reminiscent of both Bordo's and Fausto-Sterling's third-space work on bodies and sexualities, zinesters also are reweaving the mind/body duality, re-visioning the body and sexuality, and representing the ambiguous. Pérez's decolonial imaginary is also at work in zines to inform the practices of third-space re-visionings.

In addition, the politics of articulation, as discussed by Haraway, are practiced in zines to reconfigure relationships among third-space sites and subjectivities, generate new knowledges, and build coalitions and community. Finally, like Rodriguez's work referenced above, and in their own status as countercultural, zines offer unsanctioned sites of fertile ground for exploration.

(B)orderlands' Sites and Practices Beyond the Academy: Zines

While zines are written and reproduced from perspectives that represent a full range of the political spectrum, I analyze contemporary zines whose authors self-identify as feminist, seek to build and mobilize community, and work to forge alliances across lines of difference for purposes of pursuing agendas that are framed in terms of social justice and equity. An emergent coalitional consciousness is evident in zines. Zines may seem a recent phenomenon; however, according to some researchers, revolutionary pamphlets in the United States can be considered precursors. Other researchers link zines to more recent discourses, such as fanzines of the 1950s and punk zines of 1960s and beyond as the origins of zine culture (see Comstock 2001; Duncombe 2002). While I am interested in zines that may be informed by the counterculture of punk, I wish to move beyond punk culture which is often andro- and ethno-centric. Instead, I identify zines that advocate for change based on identified intersections of oppression. These identifications, forged across borders of difference, prove coalitional and inform the emergent (b)orderlands' rhetoric I have defined above. Moreover, although electronic zines are prolifically produced and readily available to some, I focus on print zines because not all feminist zinesters have access to e-zines and my emphasis is the potential of zines to build and inform community.

As I shall illustrate, feminist zines⁸ offer a space from which to speak ambiguity and contradiction. Zines not only illustrate the creative and generative capacity of third-space (discursive) practices and cultural re-production, they offer third-space subjects a powerful site for self and Other representation without the reductive, phallogocentrism required in dominant representational practices. The activist potential of zines is evident in how they demonstrate third-space consciousness, practices, and rhetorical performances. They can be irreverent, parodic, utopian, and imaginative; thus, in a sense, zines perform the difference they are trying to make. By challenging, re-imagining, and replacing exclusionary and oppressive discursive practices, zines perform new representations of subjectivity. Such radical rhetorical performances constitute a third space that offers insight into the multiple-voiced discourses that characterize third-space subjectivities.⁹

Vibrant and vital counter-hegemonic sites, feminist zines reveal a desire to connect and communicate. They also reveal overlooked concerns and un(der)represented voices. In their rants and raves against injustice and social inequality, feminist zinesters speak of and offer narratives about (the lack of) child care, issues of mental health, body image, poverty, rape, safety, spirituality, color, sex(ualities), gender, and the confines and artificiality of a dominant dichotomous social order. They are savvy, angry, complicated, and raw. The zines I analyze here re-vision and represent complicated nondominant subjectivities. Through the deployment of (b)orderlands' rhetorics, zines manifest myriad (micro) practices of resistance to enact social transformations. As Michelle Comstock states, zines have "much to teach us about the sites, practices, politics, and economies of writing" (2001, 383). As I illustrate, zines also have much to teach us about re-presentations of self and community as contradictory, complicated, ambiguous, and on the move. Specifically, these zines illustrate (1) the transformative potential beyond gender binaries; (2) the re-visioning and reclaiming of histories; (3) the practices of *reverso* (critical reversals of the normative gaze); (4) the deployment of (e)motion as embodied resistance; and (5) the emergence of a coalitional consciousness and practices of articulation that can create and mobilize communities for social justice.

Working Beyond Gender Binaries: (B)orderlands Exposed and Explored

Both as a concept and as a methodology, third space intervenes in the structures, practices, and implications of binary dualisms. (B)orderlands' rhetorics as third-space interventions in zines can be identified as "creative forms of opposition" to the neocolonizing effects of postmodern globalization (Sandoval 2000, 5). What I mean by postmodern globalization is the tendency to homogenize difference in late-stage capitalism (Bordo 1993; Patton and Sánchez-Eppler 2000). This homogenizing tendency serves to erase, often through appropriation or commodification, nondominant lived experiences and expressions from social discourses and practices. These erasures effectuated by what Bordo terms normalized heterogeneity are often effectively maintained through practices that maintain false dichotomies. The cultural re-production in zines serves to reconceive and re-vision binaristic structures as spectrums and continuums in order to more fully materialize third space. Many zines actively resist the neocolonizing effects of a strict and artificial gender dichotomy.

For example, in the zine *Pirate Jenny* (Vol. 1:3) edited and produced by P.J. Goodman, an entry by Lauren Tabak questions and critiques many taken-for-granted representations of gender identity. In an entry titled

"Sexuality, Gender and Identity: Theories on Discursive Constructionism or Hetero Hell: My Year as a Queer in a House of Straights," (n.p.) Tabak discusses the fluidity of gender identity, using the theoretical works of Adrienne Rich and Judith Butler (2000). Noting the artificial and repressive nature of gender dichotomies, Tabak states, "[h]omosexuality and heterosexuality, representing the two polarities in that metaphor, are constructions that are ultimately self-destructive. To perform the necessary roles (of straight or gay) is hard work, and is problematic when you consider the ever-expanding notion of what constitutes human sexuality and ultimately, human identity" (58).

This issue of *Pirate Jenny* includes an article titled "FTM Butch Transman FTV Gender Outlaw," which, like the work of Fausto-Sterling discussed earlier, values ambiguity in gender identity. The author deploys a (b)orderlands' rhetoric to self-represent "in some ambiguous space between butch and femme" (Vol. 1:3, 9). She names her preference for "boyz" liking how they "exist in the in between" (9). It is this engagement with and from the liminal beyond (discursive) borders that reflects third-space being and knowing. The back of this zine invites readers to "Look for this seal" after which is situated an androgynous being turned away from the reader. Beneath this figure are the labels: "Boy?" "Girl?" "Brrl." The quote underneath the figure, attributed to Adrienne Rich, acknowledges re-visioning practices as creative, and I would add third space, acts of survival in which language in both its liberating and limiting potential is explored and exposed.

In another entry in *Pirate Jenny* (Vol. 1:4) beneath the representation of "Brrl," is a quote by Andrea Dworkin reflecting third-space understanding of the fictitious nature of "man" and "woman." Its conclusion is reminiscent of Fausto-Sterling's, as discussed earlier, in that it also posits that we are a "multisexed species which has its sexuality spread along a vast continuum where the elements called male and female are not discrete" (n.p.). This issue of *Pirate Jenny* ends with a repeated "Look for this seal," but adds "of authenticity" (Vol. 1:4, back cover). From third-space sites, notions of authenticity and purity are represented as empty, stultifying, and oppressive in their effects. This play with the notion of authenticity illustrates the importance of differential consciousness, an integral part of third-space understanding. Sandoval notes that differential engagement occurs "when the affinities inside of difference attract, combine, and relate new constituencies into coalitions of resistance" (2000, 64). This recognition and willingness to engage the emptiness implicit in notions of authenticity reveals an emergent coalitional consciousness that I elaborate upon later.

An author's desire to "reach that fabled middle ground, 'the third sex,'" (n.p.) is explored in an entry in the Fall 1992 issue of *Bi•Girl World*, a zine edited and produced by Karen in Newton, Massachusetts. In an

entry titled "Looking for the Girl in the Boy and the Boy in the Girl," the author questions her desires as she explores the pleasures of third-space sexualities and sexual encounters. Bisexuality is not discussed as a subordinated or inverted opposite from either heterosexuality or homosexuality but instead as a re-imagined alternative to the obfuscations of dichotomous representations and dominant (mis)understandings of the fluidity of sexuality. The discussions of bisexuality in this zine are spoken from a third space revealing the multiplicity, fluidity, and even instability of sexual subjectivities across a spectrum in space and time. This discussion re-imagines a spectrum of sexuality and materializes the subversion of dichotomous (mis)representations of sexual subjectivity.

In the Summer 1993 issue of *Bi•Girl World*, for example, several entries question the authenticity of sexual identities and explore bi-desire from personal perspectives and experiences. One entry, "My Queerbo Desire," asks, "Is my desire so deeply queer that I internally, subconsciously, am drawn to that which is most subversive?" (n.p.). For purposes of third-space theorizing, the importance of this question lies in the expression of third space as a desirable space / space of desire. It is the third space of the liminal, the ambiguous, and the queer. No longer something to be reconciled in an either/or context, it is instead desire(able) in its ambiguity. These third-space desires are explored further by juxtaposing them on everyday experiences of being, becoming, and belonging. Third spaces become the spaces to explore deeper, more meaningful understandings of ourselves, especially as related to our desires. It is from these third spaces of growing coalitional consciousness, self-awareness, and sometimes strategic essentializing, that we can begin to identify affinities and forge alliances. (B)orderlands' rhetorics emerge as the tactics and tools to do so.

Third-space work, as I imagine it, at least in part, is an answer to the invitation made by Sandoval to acknowledge our complicated places and consciously drift into the abyss beyond dualisms in order to speak a third voice, and re-vision third meaning (2000, 142–5). This abyss is a decolonized third space where subjectivities and histories can be re-imagined and remembered and from which they can be re-presented. Sandoval notes that these third-space processes are all too often not acknowledged as "theoretical and methodological approach[es] in [their] own right" (171). It is from third space and a deployed (b)orderlands' rhetoric that we are able to identify affinities and construct coalitions for change. Importantly, it is from these third spaces that we can also begin to re-vision how history has been written about and without us and how history can begin to be re-visioned through the decolonial imaginary (Pérez 1999). It is the decolonized imaginary of the third-space subject that creatively resists and actively challenges the entrenched oppressions of structures and practices that have perpetuated dominant (mis)representations historically.

Re-visioning and Re-claiming Histories: (B)orderlands' Re-imaginings

Borderlands have historically been spaces of colonization where powerful forces have imposed, (mis)interpreted, and (mis)represented historical truths. However, (b)orderlands' subjects are often aware of and embody alternative expressions and understandings of lived experiences. Embodied (b)orderlands' understandings and practices of meaning-making and (self) representations reveal this recursive relationship as manifested in the intimate connection between place and self. Third-space sites are implicated recursively in third-space subjectivities and (historic) relations. Third-space understanding allows for the extension of the idea of (b)orderlands beyond the geographic location of our homelands to our psychic and cultural understandings, as well as to our racial, ethnic, class, sexual, gender, and even psycho-social understandings of our complexities. As Patton and Sánchez-Eppler point out, an "identity is not merely a succession of strategic moves but a highly mobile cluster of claims to self that appear and transmogrify in and of place. But place is also a mobile imaginary, a form of desire" (2000, 4). They continue, "Place is acted upon by identifiers—by identifications—that occur, as events, on/in 'it'. . . . What must be interrogated, and harnessed?: the intersection, the collision, the slippage between body-places; the partial transformation of those places; the face installed by dissimulation in place" (4). Revealing the recursivity between site and subjectivity, queer subjects, for example, often speak from a (deliberately) queered space.

An alternative relationship between self and space, represented in zines as a queering of the public realm, allows for a re-imagined sense of how things might have been or even could be. This creative recoding practice, while irreverent and even at times illegitimate, is a representational tactic of the decolonial imaginary offering a third space to explore alternatives in their fullest potential. In zines, third-space subjects are creating spaces from which to re-vision history and to recover (queer) women's voices. In the Summer 1993 issue of *Bi•Girl World* five historical bi-women are "recovered" and reconsidered. Instances of the decolonized imagination at play are evident throughout this zine as history is re-imagined from a deliberately queered perspective. Several of the voices queered in this issue are those of women of color, including Sor Juana Inés de La Cruz, Alice Walker (with a disclaimer reading "still alive! Should she [be] on these pages?"), and Josephine Baker. Beneath the entry on Sor Juana Inés de La Cruz the author has written,

(Also known as 'Sor Juana') 17th Century Mexican poet—much revered for the insight, wit & beauty of her work. Wrote love poems addressed to women & men! Joined convent at 20, yet led literary & intellectual salons, corresponded

w/writers worldwide, had her plays performed, etc. Swore off secular stuff then died. (goes to show ya)." (n.p.)

At the end of a profile of Josephine Baker the author writes, "To be honest, don't know for a fact she wuz bi~ but I've heard rumors" (n.p.). These entries, while also suggesting the possibilities of queered herstories, legitimate and validate the experiences of bi youth. The willingness to reconsider the im-possibility and un-certainty of queer women in history is a third-space tactic. One author, "baby K," deploys (b)orderlands' rhetoric to reflect on her own third-space experience in terms of sexuality, discussing the ways in which as a bi-sexual she is inauthenticated on both sides of the hetero/homosexual (b)order. Specifically, in baby K's contribution to the Summer 1993 issue of *Bi•Girl World* she writes about being "too queer to be straight and too straight to be queer" (n.p.). Her reflections are reminiscent of another zine entitled *Bamboo Girl* where one author similarly reflects on the (b)orderlands' experience of not being Filipina enough (2002).

Again, reminiscent of Pérez's work discussed previously, there is a consciousness of that which has been lost to historical record and representation in the introduction of a section titled "Bi Girls in Film and Video." Invoking the history of film, it reads,

The influence of bi girls in film extends far back into the silent film era. Biographical information of bi girls can be very sketchy and often contradictory, so many have probably been lost to history. However, as information from close friends, diaries, and personal letters comes to light, we are slowly becoming able to piece together a history of the influence these pioneering women had on the film industry. (*Bi•Girl World* 1993, n.p.)

There is a desire to engage the historic potential through ambiguity that reveals itself as re-creative and generative. Each of the issues of *Bi•Girl World* I examined include a section titled "Historical Bi Women of Note," dedicated to the recovery of bi voices and the (re)generation of queered herstories. These re-visioned histories offer a means of shared exploration and self-understanding, answering the urgent need to see oneself represented somewhere. These emergent communities afford third-space subjects the opportunity to re-write themselves into the past, making themselves visible. Historian Yolanda Leyva notes that scholars across a number of disciplinary borders are exploring the psychic and social importance of historical reconsiderations and rememberings. Leyva engages the significance of re-visioning practices and potentials particularly for marginalized communities. She writes that learning a "once silenced history [brings] forth a range of emotion . . . [to include] growing pride, a new understanding of our individual and community histories, and a sometimes-overwhelming anger" (2002). Anger at the invisibility of third-space sites and subjects in history is a common and motivating (e)motion in zines.

Practices Illuminating (E)motion as Embodied Resistance: Beings in Third Space

Anger in zines results not only from invisibility but also from imposed subordinations, restrictions, and obfuscations of identity binaries. As a way of knowing, as well as a way of be-ing and be-coming, (e)motion is therefore a motivating factor in the practices and politics of (dis)(re)articulation. Specifically, it drives the rearticulation and reweaving of oppositional representations of the mind-body dualism. These practices reveal third-space sites and subjects as constructed articulations of time, place, desire, experience, and embodiment. Regarding rigid identity markers, Patton and Sánchez-Eppler note that "the focus of attention is no longer on whether identity is ever not constructed . . . but instead on how to make sense of the always poignant and always hilarious labors of reinvention and renegotiation in new places, or in re-imagined old ones" (3). These authors go on to note how "practices of self-invention and self-authentication simultaneously give life and produce death" (7). The practices of identifying oneself are often painful and efforts to reidentify oneself are often urgently motivated by (e)motion.

For example, throughout *Housewife Turned Assassin!* (Numero #1),¹⁰ a zine produced out of North Hollywood, California, the author expresses outrage at rampant sexism. Outrage moves the author to focus on strategies of resistance to imposed, constricting, and maddening images of femininity and beauty. This zine unearths connections between patriarchy and capitalism and explores their articulated implications in practices of commodifications, exclusions, subordinations, and oppressions. It is evident from the author's specific strategies of resistance that she is aware of the complex networks and relations of power that perpetuate practices of surveillances on women's bodies and recreate subordinating images. She acknowledges the ways in which these identified power relationships and networks vigorously maintain a dichotomized and subordinating social order. For example, on one page the author represents the articulation of late capitalism and patriarchy in a reproduced postcard of sorts that pictures a body being "drawn and quartered" in the directions of "greed," "sexism," "despair," and "racism." The caption reads "United States of America" (n.p.). Above this cut-and-pasted image is an announcement of a zine titled *Function zine* with the caption, "kill the image that is killing you." Down the center of this page is written "WOMYN'S concocted sexuality is a commodity 4 CORPORATE AMERICA. Doesn't this SCARE YOU? fallacy Why is it attractive to look sooo HELPLESS?" (n.p.). These words are written around two reproduced parodic images of women photographed to appear stereotypically giddy, silly, hyper-feminine, and helpless.

The (e)motion of anger also is evident in an entry from “a feminist dictionary” on bulimia reprinted in the corner of one page to read:

BULIMIA Binge-Purge Syndrome. “An expression of anger at society, an anger which is taken out on oneself. A woman overeats (for some a carrot, for another three carrot cakes), feels bloated, guilty and angry at self so she self-induces vomiting, or fasts for a while, or uses laxatives. It’s a method to disguise one’s discontent with her treatment by others. It’s a purging of creativity, frustration and intelligence in a world where a heavy price is asked of creative women; it’s a way to feel guilty and bad about oneself when things may be going too well. It’s an ambivalent rejection of the traditional definitions of woman.” (Mary Ellen Shanese 1984, correspondence) from “a feminist dictionary” (*Housewife Turned Assassin!* Numero #1, n.p.)

The understanding that anger is both justifiable and motivating is explicit in this zine. As a demonstration, there is also a reproduced poster that identifies women’s bodies as battlegrounds calling for the support of legal abortion. This call is followed by statistics about abortion, produced in part to dispel myths about abortion. Identifying the body as battleground is, as Bordo contends, an act of resistance because it acknowledges that “self-determination has to be fought for” (1993, 263). According to Bordo, “[t]he metaphor of the body as battleground, rather than postmodern playground, captures, as well, the *practical* difficulties involved in the political struggle to empower ‘difference’” (263).

Zinesters are conscious of the political (e)motional work they are pursuing toward an alternative aesthetics to be (re)imagined and mobilized in community contexts. They demonstrate a savvy understanding of identity and body politics and the need for constructing and sustaining coalitions. For example, in a rant against sizeism and fat oppression, one zinester, Nomy Lamm, writes, *i’m so fucking beautiful* (#2 ½), a zine from Olympia, Washington, calling for a coalition of skinny kids and nonfat people to reflect on, talk about, and interrupt their privileges based on size. (E)motion is also transformed into resistance in *Tater Taught* (1) a zine from Seattle, Washington, when Emily Barber, the zine’s creator and editrix, states that she writes to focus on resistance to the normative and disciplining effects of media-imposed myths about beauty and womanhood. Her observations have led her “to a revolution; one in search of liberating women from the destructive beauty cycle, and in search to regain our power. this zine is just a tiny step in the revolution a chance to reach out to other women with out the dictation of our society” (n.p.).

Throughout *Tater Taught* deployed (e)motions demonstrate the micro-practices of resistance as well as a belief that together we can subvert the ill effects of an oppressive and corporatized mass culture. One cut-and-paste page co-titled “fight sizeism” and “feminism is not a dirty word,” reproduces a no-diet button with the word DIET and a line through it

(n.p.). Information and (e)motion are articulated in the call to “question the beauty standard,” followed by statistics that state “1 in 40,000 women meets the requirements of a model’s size and shape,” “the cosmetic industry in the U.S. grosses \$300 million a year and is growing annually by 10%,” and finally, “the diet industry currently grosses \$33 billion a year” (n.p.). Another page, picturing Barbie, reveals “The Barbie Secret,” in a balloon-caption reading “100% injection molded plastic!” (n.p.). The idea of plasticity and plastic bodies is also taken up by Bordo who notes that “the rhetoric of choice and self-determination and the breezy analogies comparing cosmetic surgery to fashion accessorizing are deeply mystifying. They efface, not only the inequalities of privilege, money, and time that prohibits most people from indulging in these practices, but the desperation that characterizes the lives of those who do” (1993, 247–8). Cosmetic surgery is depicted in *Tater Taught* as a privilege in the context of late capitalism, and it is also identified as an entrenched system of discipline and control as well as sanctioned and systematized violence carried out on the battleground of women’s bodies.

Propelled by (e)motion, zines like *Tater Taught* are de-mystifying the rhetoric of choice and resisting the restrictive images proliferated throughout society. These kinds of zines are engaging the implications of late capitalism and consumer culture on bodies in a material world, and exploring alternative narratives, images, and consumption patterns. In the opposing page to the plastic Barbie one noted above, is a page entitled, “HATE LOVE REVOLUTION” (n.p.). Barber explores (e)motions as motivators for activism and as interruptions to dominant confines of femininity,

they say hate is a bad thing and that my anger is destructive. i hate our society that oppresses women. i hate the beauty restrictions on women. i hate the superficial ideals of our society. i am angry that feminism is still viewed as a threatening, bad word. i am angry that the media constantly bombards me with messages that thinness is the only form of beauty. i hate being told that i can never be perfect, why aren't i perfect the way i am? Is this anger *wrong?* but, this anger, this hatred has forced me to stand up for myself and my rights as a woman. i am not fighting with hatred. i am using it as an outlet for my happiness. i think my anger is healthy, it's a process that can be productive. love too. girl love. when women around me complain about their weight, feeling ugly, and all the other aspects of our society that have hypnotized women of their rights, i feel hurt. this compassion and love also helped stir a revolution. (n.p.)

how I learned to do IT bloody murder is a zine by heather lynn expressing anger and alienation as well as disassociation. Her reflections are disturbingly raw, offering insight into the ways in which the everyday can be experienced as deeply distressing for girls and women. In lynn’s reflections on the contradictory messages in media portrayals of female

stars she notes, “i dream about all the glamorous ladies who died their glamorous drug and suicide deaths, and lived their glamorous lives full of rape and scars and movies” (n.p.). Later she poses what she has constructed as a self-evident question, “why is it we learn to equate love and violence?” (n.p.). She goes on to analyze a society that perpetuates this equation. She states that “we instinctively know what things are okay to talk about. we spend our whole lives creating images to distract us from real life . . . the media educated and parented me” (n.p.). She believes that her own mother’s actions have been undertaken throughout her life for purposes of distraction and survival. These realizations move her to anger against both her mother and her father. Lynn’s reflections on sex reveal other identified contradictions: “i can’t seem to figure out where sex ends and rape begins. most girls i know were introduced to sex through rape. the scary part is, alot of them don’t realize it” (n.p.). Her reflections continue with increasingly disturbing images of sexual abuse and self-mutilation. In the conclusion of this zine, she identifies her work as part of a larger book project, noting that writing is a life-saving practice and process for her. She notes that much of her fiction reflects her lived experiences. She self-identifies as “white and suburban bred, and this is just one small small interpretation of what it’s like to grow up a girl—and that’s all i’m trying to present” (n.p.). The role of (e)motion, especially anger, is implicated in the processes of coming to consciousness and action about the (discursive) practices that render bodies docile, domesticated, and controlled.

Practices of *Reverso* as Reversals of the Normative Gaze

Through a concept I have termed *reverso*, I analyze how zines are taking on the politics of the body, to include desire and pleasure, through conscious practices of a reversed critical gaze. Acts of contortion, distortion, aggression, confession, and reconciliation are reconfiguring bodies, be-ings, and belongings. Nondocile, noninnocent, re-membered bodies are emerging as corporeal subjects. Acts of re-membering are acts of reconciliation for fragmented, third-space subjects. They are subversive undertakings that serve to piece together fragmented and fragmenting histories and disembodied experiences in order to heal from the internal and external, local and global, personal and political experiences of division, subordination, disciplinary and (corporeal) punishments. Through a politics of articulation, and practices of *reverso*, zines are informing and transforming quotidian practices.

This practice of *reverso* can be traced to Wonder Woman comics. In many zines, Wonder Woman has achieved the status of icon. Often used to symbolize strength and resistance, Wonder Woman is pictured with captions that speak of a feminist utopia. A re-reading of the Wonder

Woman comics explains why she has become a zine icon. Entrenched in a lesbian utopian history, Wonder Woman's decision to participate in a heterosexual world was born of desire. To achieve her desire she was to show strength, courage, intelligence, and daring. In *Sensational Comics* we find Wonder Woman, with the help of the girls at Holliday College for Women, interrupting a plot to bring down the United States army. Dr. Poison has schemed to infuse the water supply throughout the United State military installations with a newly invented drug called "REVERSO" intended to disrupt military order (*Sensational Comics* No. 2, February 1998). This drug reverses understandings and perspectives so that the order of army camps is made chaotic by reversing the effects of commands from above, making it a challenge to exercise discipline and control. The "perceived utopia of the perfectly governed" (Foucault 1995, 198) military is shattered by reverso and much is brought to light. The concept of reverso, as I am deploying it, is at the core of zinesters' approaches to, and representations of, their mental, emotional, psychic, social, sexual, and physical subjectivities. The penetrative power of the gaze is being reversed and returned on (dominant) society in complex ways that move beyond simple inversions.

Zines contend with the oppressive effects of the social gaze in creative and resistant ways. Specifically, they are being utilized to reverse the gaze on society and ask who is mad in a mad world? Whose bodies are (in)valid in a society that modifies and commodifies bodies for profit? And in a culture of fear where alterity is at best suspect and at worst appropriated, commodified, and rendered inaccessible, how do Others achieve safety in perpetually unsafe terrain? If, as Michel Foucault contends, "invisibility is a guarantee of order," then zinesters are themselves interrupting that perceived and materialized order by rendering visible the previously invisible, indecent, invalid, and unacceptable (1995, 200). Through the concept and practice of reverso, zinesters are taking discursive control of the disciplinary mechanisms and reversing their collective gaze in order to reveal the sicknesses inherent in their societal contexts; both local and global. The effects of these shifting relationships to agency and authority are to create spaces where expert and authorized knowledges can be critically examined. It is in these third spaces that practices and discourses are being resignified, new knowledges gen(d)erated, and where bodies are being re(per)formed and re-imagined. These bodies speak the language of resistance and the potential for transformation.

In "The Body and the Reproduction of Femininity," Bordo explores resistance to muteness as the "condition of the silent, uncomplaining woman—an ideal of patriarchal culture," (1993, 177). In *Mamasita* (Issue 1) zinester Bianca from San Pablo, California, explores strategies for coming to terms with being a girl in a misogynist society by performing tactics of reverso. These tactics are manifested in a burgeoning consciousness of the experiences and implications of voicelessness, particularly for

women. *Mamasita* begins with an explanation for the deployment of the Hello Kitty logo as a deployed tactic of reverso throughout the zine,

For years now Hello Kitty has lacked a mouth—her voice never heard, her face emotionless. But now, Hello Kitty is pissed off cuz she doesn't like to be told what to do and how to do it. She doesn't like people telling her she's too ugly or too fat or too dumb or too weak or too masculine or too snobby or too loose. Hello Kitty has grown a mouth, cuz she can repress her anger no longer! Hey! **HELLO KITTY IS FUCKING PISSED!**" (n.p.)

The move to give a mouth to Hello Kitty, a commercial symbol identified as broadly representative of grrrl culture, signifies resistance to historical silencing of women. However, the symbolism extends beyond this silencing. As Bordo notes, "Even when women are silent (or verbalizing exactly the opposite), their bodies are seen as 'speaking' a language of provocation" (1993, 6). With a mouth Hello Kitty breaks the silence, spewing anger at the politics of the body that have attributed messages to women's bodies in the absence of women's voices. Breaking silences is a tactic of reverso in that it renders audible and visible the spaces and practices of (secret) abuse.

In another example of reverso, one author engages in parodic play with the absurdity of the entrenched tyrannies that govern and regulate female bodies. The headline on one page of *Mamasita* reads "YOU COULD BE THE NEXT MISS TEENAGE AMERICA®!!!" (n.p.). A photograph of a young woman embracing a young man is captioned "How to Get Him" (n.p.). Off to the side of the page is a woman in a bathing suit advertising something called "CAN," a product that dissolves fat, enhances breast size, and generally feminizes the body "or your money back" (n.p.). The text of this page reflects the frustration of being a teenage girl in the midst of all of these messages and images. Sardonicly, the text invites girls to become anorexic or bulimic to fit the image. It calls girls to become hyper-feminized and childlike while also sexualized: "Get your tits filled with silicon to at least a size 38D. Remember bigger is better. *Paint your face with poison making sure to accentuate your cheek-bones. Practice pouting and appearing helps If you do not do what the guidelines suggest there will be no chance of you ever winning, because you are a fat pig of pores and pimples! Call: 1-800-KIL-TEEN GOOD LUCK!!!!!" (n.p.). This zine demonstrates an acute awareness of how practices of discipline and control of the female body recreate bodies of hyper-feminization and voicelessness. There is an understanding that "pathologies of female protest" that are often a part of the anorectic's experience will serve to reproduce, not transform, that which is being protested (Bordo, 177).

The gaze is also reversed by many zinesters as they make meaning of abuse. These zines articulate the abuses of the body experienced in a misogynist society dictated by normative standards of beauty, sexuality,

gender, to other forms of abuse including rape and incest. *100%* (Vol 2:2), for example, deals with the contradictions of desire, the shame and self-blame of incest, and tactics of self-transformation. In an anonymous entry, one writer describes her efforts to keep “two generations of molestation” from bleeding into the third generation (n.p.). She explains that her motivations for telling her story now are to reject self-blame and reverse the imposed silence about the abuse. This author identifies her efforts to share the personal in order to engage the political and build community for purposes of resistance and healing through new ways of being. Speaking out, she effectively reverses the code of silence that often prevails in relationships of incest and sexual molestation and thereby creates a space for dialogue and potential healing.

Coalitional Consciousness and Practices of Articulation: Creating and Mobilizing Communities for Social Justice

Zinesters also reflect a coalitional consciousness in their efforts to build community, produce knowledge, and share information. They demonstrate a shared understanding about the ill effects of patriarchal social orderings. Zinesters often discuss the ways in which girls, and women, are divided from one another through patriarchal divisions based on, among other things, outward appearance, size, class, and competition. Girls and women strategize tactics of resistance that serve to build communities and instantiate other ways of being in the world. They demonstrate a decolonized imaginary in their expressions of these third-space communities. Reproduced resistant practices generate new knowledge in virtual communities constructed by zinesters in dialogue with one another. Social space has come to be configured, as Foucault points out, to ensure “surveillance which would be both global and individualising while at the same time carefully separating the individuals under observation” (1980, 146). In their efforts to build community through coalition, zinesters are actively resisting this imposed separation.

Zines materialize and reflect (b)orderlands' rhetorics of representation not only through the language of resistance and opposition, but also, importantly, through the language of coalition that provides alternative sources of information. For example, *Bamboo Girl*, a zine out of New York City edited and produced by Sabrina Margarita Sandata, is dedicated to “brown” women. Brown is a named and identifiable ambiguity that is deployed strategically to build community and forge coalition across lines of difference. Issue 11 focuses on women of color and mental health. In an article titled “Herbal Allies for Crazy Grls,” author Piepzna-Samarashina reclaims her right to share knowledge based on her own experiences: “I don't got any fancy letters after my name. . . . I'm a girl who's been crazy

who has been studying herbs for about ten years now on my own" (37). This zine challenges expert knowledge and spaces of the official by engaging in the unofficial sharing of information. Specifically, it legitimates and validates lived experience as valid and valuable. Piepzna-Samarashina's entry articulates lived experience with traditional practices, especially in regard to well being, to proliferate information and knowledge in community contexts. It also demonstrates myriad examples of resistance to exclusionary practices that rely on expert, authorized knowledge. Many zines also question expert knowledge and the role of theory that is not accessible in community contexts. For example, in *Don't Turn Your Back on Her—She's . . . HURRICANE GIRL* (Volume 1, Fall 1998), a zine out of Milwaukee, Wisconsin, Katie, the editor/author offers the following critique of accessibility to authorized knowledges in an academic context: "If a roomful of college students who've been trained to read this kind of crap don't understand . . . WHO is your audience? . . . when it comes to feminist and Queer theory . . . particularly in these two areas, scholarship should be tied to activism" (1998, 7). Coalitional consciousness informs the need for authorized knowledges, and theories, to be accountable and accessible to the communities they are supposedly representing.

Zinesters practice a politics of articulation—linking class, literacy, sexuality, and gender to environmental and feminist interests—as explained by Haraway. For example, *Calico* (#5), a zine produced by Heather, Rachel, & Stacy, manifests a coalitional consciousness through the practices and politics of articulation. This zine further demonstrates the values of community, community-building, and volunteerism. By reproducing an information sheet from the American Cancer Society on breast self-examination this zine demonstrates its commitment to proliferate information about women's health. The second page of this zine uses a third-space practice of code-switching between English and Spanish as a community-building, and information-disseminating tactic to call for volunteers to eliminate illiteracy. The page begins with "Listen Up! ¡Escuchan!" (9). In bubble boxes for dialogue a group of middle-aged white middle-class men and women ask, "How Does Illiteracy Affect Me?" (9). The responses on the page include statistics about the cost of illiteracy and its ill effects across a number of contexts including poverty, crime, discrimination, productivity, family and work problems. By identifying and articulating the multiple dimensions and related complexities of illiteracy as a community problem the artificial divisions so often sustained in the name of (maintaining) a given social order are resisted. These divisions are subverted in the action-oriented approach being advocated to alleviate and solve the shared responsibilities and problems of illiteracy.

In another example of the politics of articulation and coalitional consciousness, one entry titled "Dyke Page: We're Queer Friendly" articulates or links ignorance, illiteracy, and homophobia, and offers a personal

reflection on the experience and effects of homophobia (14). Situating this page after the page on illiteracy is a savvy tactic that links illiteracies beyond the inability to read texts but also to (mis)interpreting bodies, sexualities, and culture as well. Part two of this page questions and resists the politics of desire that move men and boys to gaze upon lesbian sex as entertainment. Lesbianism is referred to as "either [a] choice or [biological]" and it is defined as "much more than just sex" (14). Again, community information is reproduced for those within gay and lesbian communities and for those interested in being an ally to these communities. The linking of allies with gays and lesbians again demonstrates the willingness and ability to identify and forge coalitions to re-imagine and recreate a more just space in which to cohabitate.

Throughout *Housewife Turned Assassin!* (Numero #1), multiple calls to consciousness demonstrate a deployment of a coalitional consciousness toward the goal of building community. There are pages on "*stuff 2 read*" with a call to "put your mind 2 work. sit your ass & read a book" (n.p.). Across another page is written "Read and Think" (n.p.). This section reproduces a page from "Marlene Fried & Loretta Ross' pamphlet 'Reproductive freedom: our right to decide,'" which begins with the fist of resistance in the center of the symbol for woman. The reproduced pamphlet states, "In whatever sphere of activism we choose—education, agitation, inspiration, legislation—whether we are building organizations or creating alternative structures and communities of resistance, we must trust in our ability to find answers from our own lives" (n.p.). The inclusion of this page is a message to readers that personal reflection is a valuable tool and necessary exercise in coming to coalitional consciousness. The valuing of one's story and its application to a broader context are understood as activist and political acts with consequences for the greater community. The ideas that love, action, education, and anger can be articulated for purposes of social activism are promoted throughout this zine. One page of this zine is dedicated to the building of a "Secret Girlfriend Society," through the sharing of information and collective action. There is also a direct action page that reports on the planned use of "red-and-white stickers declaring 'This Insults Women,' 'This Promotes Violence Against Women,' and 'This Promotes Hatred of Women'" (n.p.). The zine ends with a handwritten note from "Sisi" who explains that she co-produced this zine "cuz I'm pissed off at the way shit is & I feel that sharing ideas & knowledge is a way in which we can stop the cycle of humyn egocentric behavior—which includes: racism, genderism, classism, ignorance, greed, & violence. This is my contribution to the mind revolution that should be occurring always" (n.p.). Deployed (b)orderlands' rhetorics demonstrate the politics of articulation and coalitional consciousness that inform the production of this zine.

A (b)orderlands' rhetoric is also deployed in *La Bone* (#3), a zine out of Seattle, Washington, to identify, inform, and build community based on

identified intersections of subjectivity. Octavia, the zine creator, spends time and space performing community education especially in regard to AIDS. On the second page of this zine there's a seven-step guide to cleaning needles and syringes. The following page is dedicated to "GRRRLS AND AIDS" followed by information on babies and AIDS (n.p.). These pages are followed by a personal reflection on (bi)sexual identity and feminism at the intersections of ethnicity and Catholicism. Invisibility is identified as that which inhibits awareness and the potential to develop a coalitional consciousness. This zinester illuminates the experiences of invisibility at the intersections of contradictory identity positionings.

(B)orderlands' Rhetorics as Tools and Tactics of (Re)Presentation

Borders have historically served to inauthenticate and illegitimate the knowledge claims, indeed the very presence, of third-space sites and subjectivities. As I have demonstrated, however, the lived condition of crossing borders and existing in the realm of both/and allows for the possibility of consciously drifting into the recreative terrain of third space and engaging the transformative possibilities of (b)orderlands' rhetorics. Having conceptualized rhetoric as the interpretation, recreation, and deployment of (discursive) signs, symbols, and images to represent meanings, I have utilized a third-space framework to both critique dichotomy and to theorize (b)orderlands' rhetorics and their representational potentials. Specifically, this paper has shown how (b)orderlands' rhetorics are deployed in third-space sites to move beyond gender binaries, re-imagine histories, reverse the gaze, build community, and speak (e)motion and desire through rearticulating the body to ways of knowing, being, and becoming in the world. (B)orderlands' rhetorics offer an exciting potential to speak that which has been overlooked, underrepresented, and actively obscured. Like Celeste Condit who identifies and investigates how "critical rhetoric has redefined history" to allow for the re-presentation of historical stories and movements of social change (1999, 173), I, too, look to the re-presentation of our stories and their transformative potentials. The third-space sites analyzed here manifest and expose fertile, decolonized, third spaces for re-invention and re-presentation. More specifically, these zines reflect hope through their potential to generate a new value system imagined by Anzaldúa when she stated that she was participating "in the creation of yet another culture, a new story to explain the world and our participation in it, a new value system with images and symbols that connect us to each other and to the planet" (Anzaldúa 1987, 102–3). This new coalitional value system articulates third-space corporeal and relational subjects, our sites, and our discourses, to our activism and visions of social

justice. If we can continue to work in third space between the borders of academic and nonacademic writing and representation—as I have done in this article—we can see more possibilities for feminist activism and coalition building.

Adela C. Licona, a Ph.D. candidate in (B)orderlands' Rhetorics at Iowa State University, is also the research and editorial assistant for the NWSA Journal. She is co-editor with Aimee Carrillo Rowe of the current cluster of essays, "Moving Locations: Beyond the Limits of Identity." She is currently researching radical rhetorical performances in zines as sites offering insight into the multiple-voiced discourses that, for her, characterize third-space subjectivities. Her most recent work, "La Migra," appears in *Sexing the Political*. Other publications include a forthcoming co-authored article with Carl Herndl, "Shifting Agency: Agency, Kairos, and the Possibilities of Social Action," in *The Cultural Turn: Perspectives on Communicative Practices in Workplaces and Professions*. She has a long history of involvement in local and national politics and is a peace, literacy, hunger, civil rights, and domestic violence activist.

Acknowledgments

Adela thanks friends, familia, and anonymous reviewers for their insight and helpful suggestions on this article. Additionally, she thanks Laura Micham, Director, and Amy Leigh Hagardorn, Archivist, from the Sallie Bingham Center for Women's History and Culture at the Rare Book, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library at Duke University.

Notes

1. This term is deployed in Chela Sandoval's *Methodology of the Oppressed* (2000) and refers to a consciousness that "arises between and through [different] meaning systems" (180). Its subject is able to function within and beyond dominant ideologies. It captures the movement that joins different networks of consciousness for purposes of coalition and ultimately transformation.
2. For a full discussion on *sitios y lenguas* see Emma Pérez's "Irigaray's Female Symbolic in the Making of Chicana Sitios y Lenguas (Sites and Discourses)" in *Living Chicana Theory*, edited by Carla Trujillo (199, 87–101).
3. Coming to identify and name a (b)orderlands' rhetoric is not without struggle and conflict for me. I fear losing sight of the tangible and material realities, inequities, and injustices that prevail in the Mexico-U.S. borderlands from which I come. However, I resist the tendency for fear to inhibit or immobilize

exploration and action. And so I proceed into third space with this tension that is informed by borderlands—and an emergent (b)orderlands' rhetoric—that for me (discursively) represent both the tangible and the psychic, the material and the metaphoric; in short, both/and consciousness.

4. For discussions about the recursive relationship between theory and practice see also Anzaldúa 1987; hooks 1991; Moraga 1998; and Anzaldúa and Keating 2002.
5. For discussions on the colonizing effects of discourse see also Anzaldúa 1987; Nye 1990; Pérez 1999; Smith 1999; Gray-Rosendale and Gruber 2000; and Carrillo Rowe 2005.
6. Nedra Reynolds also crosses academic boundaries by articulating feminist and cultural studies to composition studies claiming that “we need to rethink radically the forms of writing we find acceptable” (198, 71). This claim has implications for the sites and texts we research and reproduce as third-space feminists interested in [(b)orderlands'] rhetorics and politics of re-presentation.
7. There is an affinity between Pérez's notion of the interstitial and Pérez-Torres's notion of interlingualism. He defines interlingualism as that which “implies the constant tension of [at least] two at once” (1995, 213). For me, the notion of interstitialism also speaks to the “tension” of at least “two at once.” That is to say, interstitialism reflects the interstices of identity that, from a feminist poststructural and postcolonial perspective, represent the intersubjectivities or multiple intersections of third-space identities. The space of the interstitial then becomes the space from which third-space subjectivities can be (re)presented and rendered visible.
8. All but two of the zines I analyze here are housed at the Sallie Bingham Center for Women's History and Culture in the Rare Books, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library at Duke University. Specifically, the zines come from both the Sarah Dyer (ca. 1988–1999) and Dwayne Dixon (ca. 1984–1995) collections.
9. For further discussion on multiple-voiced discourses and subjectivities see Herndl and Licona, forthcoming, 2005; Anzaldúa 1987; Gates 1998; DuBois 1998; Bakhtin 1998.
10. Had it been possible, I would have preferred to replicate the original, and often inconsistent, citation style of volume and/or issue number of each zine. In that way I could have captured and reproduced the creative discursive practices and representational strategies that occur even there. However, for purposes of uniformity for the *Journal* I have utilized consistent parenthesis around volume and/or issue numbers. Also, in the interest of the dialogue I am hoping to evoke across academic and nonacademic borders, and because I value the sometimes raw and spontaneous expressions in zines, I have neither imposed

corrections nor identified unconventional language practices as textual errors. To the best of my ability I have reproduced titles and quotes as they appear in the zines I have analyzed.

References

- 100%, Volume 2:2. Sarah Dyer Zine Collection, Rare Book, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library, Box 1, Duke University, Durham, NC.
- Anzaldúa, Gloria. 1987. *Borderlands/La Frontera: The New Mestiza*. San Francisco: Aunt Lute Books.
- Anzaldúa, Gloria E., and AnaLouise Keating, eds. 2002. *This Bridge We Call Home: Radical Visions for Transformation*. New York: Routledge.
- Bakhtin, Mikhail. 1998. "Discourse in the Novel." In *Literary Theory: An Anthology*, eds. Julie Rivkin and Michael Ryan, 32–44. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers.
- Bamboo Girl Zine*. 2002. Issue 11. Sabrina Margarita Sandata, ed. New York, NY.
- Bi•Girl World*, Summer 1993. Sarah Dyer Zine Collection, Rare Book, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library, Box 1, Duke University, Durham, NC.
- Bi•Girl World*, Fall 1992. Sarah Dyer Zine Collection, Rare Book, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library, Box 1, Duke University, Durham, NC.
- Bordo, Susan. 1993. "The Body and the Reproduction of Femininity." In *Unbearable Weight: Feminism, Western Culture, and the Body*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Calico* #5. Sarah Dyer Zine Collection, Rare Book, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library, Box 1, Duke University, Durham, NC.
- Carrillo Rowe, Aimee. 2005/in press. "Be Longing: Toward a Feminist Politics of Relation." In *NWSA Journal* 17.2.
- Comstock, Michelle. 2001. "Grrrl Zine Networks: Re-Composing Spaces of Authority, Gender, and Culture." *JAC* 21(2):383–409.
- Condit, Celeste Michelle. 1999. "The Character of 'History' in Rhetoric and Cultural Studies: Recoding Genetics." In *At the Intersection: Cultural Studies and Rhetorical Studies*, ed. Thomas Rosteck. New York: The Guilford Press.
- Don't Turn Your Back on Her—She's . . . HURRICANE GIRL*, Volume 1, Fall 1998. Sarah Dyer Zine Collection, Rare Book, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library, Box 3, Duke University, Durham, NC.
- DuBois, W.E.B. 1998. *The Souls of Black Folk*. In *Literary Theory: An Anthology*, eds. Julie Rivkin and Michael Ryan, 868–72. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers.
- Duncombe, Stephen. 2002. "'I'm a Loser Baby': Zines and the Creation of Underground Identity." In *Hop on Pop: The Politics and Pleasures of Popular Culture*, eds. Henry Jenkins, Tara McPherson, and Jane Shattuc. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Fausto-Sterling, Anne. 2000. *Sexing the Body: Gender Politics and the Construction of Sexuality*. New York: Basic Books.

- Foucault, Michel. 1995. *Discipline & Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. New York: Vintage Books.
- . 1980. *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews & Other Writings 1972–1977*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Gates, Henry Louis. 1998. "The Blackness of Blackness: A Critique on the Sign and the Signifying Monkey." In *Literary Theory: An Anthology*, eds. Julie Rivkin and Michael Ryan, 903–22. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers.
- Gray-Rosendale, Laura, and Sibylle Gruber, eds. 2001. *Alternative Rhetorics: Challenges to the Rhetorical Tradition*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Haraway, Donna. 1991. *Simians, Cyborgs, and Women: The Reinventions of Nature*. New York: Routledge.
- . 1992. The Promises of Monsters: A Regenerative Politics for Inappropriate/d Others. In *Cultural Studies*, eds. Lawrence Grossberg, Cary Nelson, and Paula A. Treichler. New York: Routledge.
- Haraway, Donna J. 1997. *Modest_Witness@Second_Millennium. FemaleMan©_Meets_OncoMouse™: Feminism and Technoscience*. New York: Routledge.
- hooks, bell. 1991. "bell hooks." In *Angry Women*, eds. Andrea Juno and V. Vale. New York, NY: Powerhouse Books.
- Housewife Turned Assassin!* Numero #1. Sarah Dyer Zine Collection, Rare Book, Manuscript and Special Collections Library, Box 3, Duke University, Durham, NC.
- how i learned to do IT bloody murder*. Sarah Dyer Zine Collection, Rare Book, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library, Box 3, Duke University, Durham, NC.
- i'm so fucking beautiful* #2 ½. Sarah Wood Zine Collection, Rare Book, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library, Duke University, Durham, NC.
- La Bone* #3. Sarah Dyer Zine Collection, Rare Book, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library, Box 1, Duke University, Durham, NC.
- Leyva, Yolanda Chávez. 2002. "The Re-visioning of History Es Una Gran Limpia: Teaching and Historical Trauma in Chicana/o History, Part II." In *La Voz de Esperanza*, October.
- Mamasita*, Issue 1. Sarah Dyer Zine Collection, Rare Book, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library, Box 4, Duke University, Durham, NC.
- Marston, William Molton, and H. G. Peter, eds. 1998. "Sensational Comics No. 2, February." In *Archive Editions: Wonder Woman Archives, Volume 1*. New York: D.C. Comics
- Moraga, Cherríe. 1998. "Free at Last." In *Living Chicana Theory*, ed. Carla Trujillo. Berkeley: Third Woman Press.
- Nye, Andrea. 1990. *Words of Power: A Feminist Reading of the History of Logic*. New York: Routledge.
- Patton, Cindy, and Benigno Sánchez-Eppler, eds. 2000. *Queer Diasporas*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Pérez, Emma. 1999. *The Decolonial Imaginary: Writing Chicanas into History*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- . 1998. "Irigaray's Female Symbolic in the Making of Chicana Sitios y Lenguas

- (Sites and Discourses)." In *Living Chicana Theory*, ed. Carla Trujillo, 87–101. Berkeley: Third Woman Press.
- Pérez-Torres, Rafael. 1995. *Movements in Chicano Poetry: Against Myths, Against Margins*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Piepzna-Samarashina, Leah Lakshmi. 2002. "Herbal Allies for Crazy Grls." *Bamboo Girl Zine*, April: 11, 37–41.
- Pirate Jenny: A Saucy Little Zine for Your Inner Feminist Revolutionary*. 2000. Volume 1, Issue 3, ed. P.J. Goodman. Santa Barbara, CA.
- Pirate Jenny: A Saucy Little Zine for Your Inner Feminist Revolutionary*. 2000. Volume 1, Issue 4, ed. P.J. Goodman. Santa Barbara, CA.
- Reynolds, Nedra. 1998. "Interrupting Our Way to Agency: Feminist Cultural Studies and Composition." In *Feminism and Composition: In Other Words*, eds. Susan Jarrat and Lynn Worsham. New York: MLA.
- Rodríguez, Juana María. 2003. *Queer Latinidad: Identity Practices, Discursive Spaces*. New York: New York University Press.
- Sandoval, Chela. 2000. *Methodology of the Oppressed: Theory Out of Bounds*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Smith, Linda Tuhiwai. 1999. *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples*. New York: Zed Books Ltd.
- Tabak, Lauren. 2000. Volume 1, Issue 3. "Sexuality, Gender and Identity: Theories on Discursive Constructionism or Hetero Hell: My Year as a Queer in a House of Straights." In *Pirate Jenny*, ed. P.J. Goodman. Santa Barbara, CA.
- Tater Taught* #1. Sarah Dyer Zine Collection, Rare Book, Manuscript, and Special Collections Library, Box 7, Duke University, Durham, NC.
- Trujillo, Carla, ed. 1998. *Living Chicana Theory*. Berkeley: Third Woman Press.

Copyright of NWSA Journal is the property of Indiana University Press. The copyright in an individual article may be maintained by the author in certain cases. Content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.